BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06102082 2

UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

FAULT AND RESPONSIBILITY

Professor Bruce Chapman

Fall 2006

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
AUG
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAULT AND RESPONSIBILITY

Professor Bruce Chapman

Fall 2006

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

FAULT AND RESPONSIBILITY

CONTENTS

I Introduction

"Moral Luck" – In Thomas Nagel, *Mortal Questions* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1979) 24-38..... I-1

Enoch, D. and Marmor, A., "The Case Against Moral Luck", forthcoming Journal of Value Inquiry..... I-9

II Fault and Responsibility in Tort Law – General Theory

Holmes, O., "The Common Law" (Boston: Little Brown, 1881)..... II-1

Weinrib, E., "Liberty, Community, and Corrective Justice" 1(1) *Can. J. of Law & Jurisprudence* (1977) 3-17..... II-4

Honoré, T. "Responsibility and Luck," 104 *The Law Quarterly Review* (1988) 530-553..... II-12

Vaughan v. Menlove (1837) 3 Bing. (N.C.) 468..... II-24

III Fault and Responsibility in Tort Law – Special Problems

A. The Less Capable Defendant

McHale v. Watson (1966) 115 C.L.R. 199..... III-1

Laverdure et al. v. City of Victoria (1952) 7 W.W.R. 334..... III-10

Nelson v. town of the Pas (1969) 67 W.W.R. 580..... III-12

B. Problems of Causation

Stapleton, J. "Perspectives on Causation" in Oxford Essays in Jurisprudence, 4th Series, J. Horder ed. (Oxford: OUP 2002) 61-84..... III-15

Thomson, J. J. "Remarks on Causation and Liability" 13 Philosophy and Public Affairs (1984) 101-133..... III-28

IV Fault and Responsibility in Criminal Law – General Theory

Bayles, M. "Character, Purpose, and Criminal Responsibility" 1 Law and Philosophy (1982) 5-20..... IV-1

Brudner, A., "Agency & Welfare in the Penal Law" in S. Shite, J. Gardner, & J. Horder, (eds.) *Action and Value in Criminal Law* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993) 21-53..... IV-9

Duff, R.A., "Choice, Character, and Criminal Liability" 12 *Law and Philosophy* (1993) 345-383..... IV-26

V Fault and Responsibility in Criminal Law – Special Problems

A. Mens Rea

"Recklessness" – in R.A. Duff, *Intention, Agency & Criminal Liability: Philosophy of Action & The Criminal Law* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1990) 139-179..... VA-1

Headnote from *D.P.P. v. Morgan* [1976] A.C. 182..... VA-22

Headnote from *Pappajohn v. The Queen* [1980] 2 S.C.R. 120..... VA-23

Headnote from *Sansregret v. The Queen* [1985] 1 S.C.R. 570..... VA-24

Headnote from *R. v. Ewanchuk* (1998) 13 C.R. (5th) 324 (C.A.)..... VA-26

R. v. Ewanchuk (1999) 69 D.L.R. (4th) 193 (S.C.C.)..... VA-29

B. Defence of Provocation and Culture

Klimchuk, D., "Outrage, Self-Control, and Culpability" 44 *U. of T. Law J.* (1994) 441-468..... VB-1

"Are Objective Standards Worth Saving? Exploring the Feminist Debate" – in M. Moran, *Rethinking The Reasonable Person* (Oxford: OUP, 2003) 198-231... VB-16

Golding, M.P. "The Cultural Defence" 15(2) *Ratio Juris* (June 2002) 146-158.... VB-50

VI Individual Responsibility in 'Abnormal' Moral Contexts

Delgado, R. "'Rotten Social Background': Should the Criminal Law Recognize A Defence of Severe Environmental Deprivation?" 3 *Law & Inequality* (1985) 571-591..... VI-1

Wolf, S., "Sanity and the Metaphysics of Responsibility" in Responsibility, Character and the Emotions, Schoeman ed., (Cambridge 1988) 46-62..... VI-12

Adams, K.A. "What is Just?: The Rule of Law and Natural Law in the Trial of former East German Border Guards" excerpted from 29 Stanford J. of International Law (1993)..... VI-21

Calhoun, C., "Responsibility and Reproach" 99 *Ethics* (1989) 389-406..... VI-30

VII Institutional and National Responsibilities: Implications for Individuals And Collectives

Luban, d., "the Adversary System Excuse" – in D. Luban (ed.), *The Ethics of Lawyers* (New York: New York UP, 1994) 139-178..... VII-1

Fletcher, g. "Liberals and Romantics at War: the Problem of Collective Guilt" 111 Yale Law Journal 1499 (excerpts)..... VII-22

Pettit, P. "Responsibility Incorporated" (unpublished)..... VII-44

VIII Time and Responsibility

Sher, G., "Ancient Wrongs & Modern Rights" 10(1) *Philosophy Pub. Affairs* (1980) 3-17..... VIII-1

Waldron, J., "Superseding Historic Justice" 103 *Ethics* (Oct 1992) 4-28..... VIII-9

Roberts, R., "The Morality of a Moral Statute of Limitations on Injustice" 7 *Journal of Ethics* (2003) 115-138..... VIII-22

IX The Question of Remedy

Allen, J., Balancing Justice and Social Unity: Political Theory and the Idea of a Truth and Reconciliation Commission" 49(3) *U. of T. Law Journal* (1999) 315-353..... IX-1

Llewellyn, J., "Dealing With the Legacy of Native Residential School Abuse in Canada: Litigation, ADR, and Restorative Justice" 52(3) *U. of T. Law Journal* (2002) 253-300..... IX-21

Brophy, A.L., "Some Conceptual and Legal Problems in Reparations for Slavery" 58 *N.Y.U. Ann. Surv. Of Am. L.* (2003) 497-555..... IX-46

McGary, H., "Achieving Democratic Equality: Forgiveness, Reconciliation, and Reparations" 7 *Journal of Ethics* (2003) 93-113..... IX-61